



Medium-Term Impacts of Integrated Social Safety Nets: Cash Transfers, Information Meetings, and Home Visits for Child Development

Second Submission: RR_BFA_2025_475

Ankriti Singh, Ceren Huryol

reproducibility@worldbank.org

November 4, 2025

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Medium-Term Impacts of Integrated Social Safety Nets: Cash Transfers, Information Meetings, and Home Visits for Child Development*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit in the main section of the paper and 10 randomly selected exhibits in the appendix were reproduced accurately**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Updating the working directory.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 2 hours to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on 2 types of data: open, and limited-access (available to World bank staff).
 - Open data is included in the public reproducibility package.
 - Reviewers used forthcoming/accessible/restricted data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. The data is forthcoming on the World Bank Microdata Library and Development Data Hub.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming/accessible/limited-access/restricted data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**

- **Data:** Some data is not yet publicly available but is expected to be made available through the World Bank Microdata Library and Development Data Hub in the future.
- **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
- **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
- **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure 1** Does not apply. Figure does not represent analysis results.
- **Figure 2** Does not apply. Figure does not represent analysis results.
- **Figure 3** Reproduced. Verified against *Indices_all_June2025.png*.
- **Table 1A** Reproduced. Verified against *SummaryStats.xlsx*.
- **Table 1B** Reproduced. Verified against *SummaryStats.xlsx*.
- **Table 2** Reproduced. Verified against *BalanceTables_2025May.xlsx*.
- **Table 3** Results reproduced, but table or figure includes manual changes from code output. Verified against *SecSR_TableSR_RI_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table 4** Results reproduced, but table or figure includes manual changes from code output. Column 8 "Pregnancies" was verified against *SecSR_TableSR_RI_Reg_June2025.xlsx*. The rest of the columns were compared against *Sec19_Table_MISC_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table 5** Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output. Verified against *anthro_TableANT_RI_CS_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table 6** Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output. Verified against *Edu_TableEDU_RI_CS_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table 7** Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output. Verified against *Denver_TableDEN_RI_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table 8** Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output. Verified against *Sec27_TableA3_RI_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table 9** Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output. Verified against *SecCT_TableCT_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table 10** Does not apply. Table is produced by IPA.
- **Table 11** Does not apply. Table shows cost effectiveness analysis and was not included in the code.

Results in the Annex For the Appendix, we did not review every exhibit. Instead, we randomly selected 10 exhibits out of 14 from the remaining datasets to assess the appendix. Our review was based on those 10 exhibits. Since they were chosen randomly, we are operating under the assumption that if all randomly selected exhibits are reproducible, then the rest should be as well. The seed used to generate the random selection was 762769, the Stata version used was 18.5, and the exhibits selected were: 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 13, 14.

- **Table A2 Reproduced.** Verified against *Lasso_SummStats_2025May.xlsx*.
- **Table A4 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *SecSR_TableSR_RI_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table A5 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *Sec19_Table_MISC_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table A6 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *anthro_TableANT_RI_CS_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table A7 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *Edu_TableEDU_RI_CS_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table A8 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *Denver_TableDEN_RI_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table A9 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *Sec27_TableA3_RI_Reg_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table A12 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *SecSR_TableSR_HET_Reg_June2025.xlsx* (Pregnancy Index), *Sec19_Table_MISC_HET_Reg_June2025.xlsx* (Health Behaviours Index), *anthro_TableANT_Het_Reg_June2025.xlsx* (Anthropometrics), *Edu_TableEDU_HET_Reg_June2025.xlsx* (Education), *Denver_TableDEN_Het_Reg_June2025.xlsx* (Denver), *Sec27_TableA3_Het_Reg_June2025.xlsx* (SD Index) .
- **Table A14 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *Attrition_Reg_T3T4_June2025.xlsx*.
- **Table A15 Results reproduced, but table includes manual changes from code output.** Verified against *vill 74 151 arm, HH 74 151 arm, Prenatal 74 151 arm, Edu 74 151, Denver 74 151 arm, Strengths 74 151 arm, ECD 74 151 arm in BalanceTables_2025May.xlsx*.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: INTEL(R) XEON(R) PLATINUM 8562Y+ 2.80 GHz (4 processors)
- Memory available: 32.0 GB
- Software version: Stata 18.0 MP