



Who benefits from public spending on healthcare? Longitudinal evidence from Ethiopia

Second Submission: RR_ETH_2025_469

Ceren Huryol, Mahin Tariq
reproducibility@worldbank.org
November 20, 2025

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “Who benefits from public spending on healthcare? Longitudinal evidence from Ethiopia”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit in the main section of the paper has been reproduced accurately.**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Changing the file paths in the main do file
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 30 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors in the reproducibility package.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on 2 types of data: accessible (public but not included in the reproducibility package), and restricted data (available only from the data owners).
 - Reviewers used restricted data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming/accessible/limited-access/restricted data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is restricted and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, please refer to the README file.

- **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
- **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
- **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Table 1** Reproduced.
- **Table 2** Reproduced.
- **Table 3** Reproduced.
- **Table 4** Reproduced.
- **Figure 1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 2** Reproduced.
- **Table 5** Reproduced.
- **Figure 3** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4** Reproduced.
- **Table 6** Reproduced.
- **Table 7** Reproduced.
- **Figure 5** Results reproduced, but the figure includes manual changes from code output. Values in the figure were reproduced, however the figure was created on excel manually.
- **Table 8** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6** Reproduced.

Results in the Annex

- **Table A1** Reproduced.
- **Table A2** Reproduced.
- **Table A3** Reproduced.
- **Table A4** Reproduced.
- **Table A5** Reproduced.
- **Figure A1** Reproduced.
- **Figure A2** Reproduced.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
- Memory available: 15.7 GB
- Software version: Stata 18.0 MP