



Wage Subsidies To Promote Female Hiring: Evidence From Pakistan

First Submission: RR_PAK_2025_511

Camila Ayala

reproducibility@worldbank.org

December 22, 2025

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Wage Subsidies To Promote Female Hiring: Evidence From Pakistan*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit in the main section of the paper and 10 randomly selected exhibits in the appendix were reproduced accurately**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Adjusting the file path in the 0. master.do do-file and running the code.
 2. Adjusting the file path in the 3. htes_fig0A4-5.R script and running the code.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 4 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors in the reproducibility package.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on one type of data: forthcoming (to be made available in the future).
 - Reviewers used forthcoming data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. Forthcoming on the World Bank Microdata Library.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.

- **Reproducibility Summary:**

- **Data:** All data is not yet publicly available but is expected to be made available through the World Bank Microdata Library in the future.
- **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
- **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
- **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Table 1 Reproduced.** Verified against `sumstats.tex`. Minor formatting and labeling differences.
- **Table 2 Reproduced.** Verified against `itt_hiringwomen.tex`. Minor formatting differences.
- **Table 3 Reproduced.** Verified against `itt_hiringwomenother.tex`. Minor formatting differences.
- **Table 4 Reproduced.** Verified against `admin_itt.tex`. Minor formatting and rounding differences.
- **Figure 1 Reproduced.** Verified against `HTE_KernelIV.pdf`.
- **Figure 2 Reproduced.** Verified against `het_firmjob.png`.

Results in the Annex

For the Appendix, we did not review every exhibit. Instead, we randomly selected 10 exhibits from the remaining exhibits to assess the appendix. Our review was based on those 10 exhibits. Since they were chosen randomly, we are operating under the assumption that if all randomly selected exhibits are reproducible, then the rest should be as well. The seed used to generate the random selection was 475862, the Stata version used was 19, and the exhibits selected were: Table A1, Table A3, Table A4, Table A5, Table A6, Table A7, Table A8, Figure A4, Figure A5, and Figure A7.

- **Table A1 Reproduced.** Verified against `Balance.tex`. Minor formatting differences.
- **Table A3 Reproduced.** Verified against `across_gender_pref.tex`.
- **Table A4 Reproduced.** Verified against `attrition_HFS.tex`. The table is fully reproducible. However, the code-generated version includes additional variables that are not reported in the paper.
- **Table A5 Reproduced.** Verified against `tot.tex`. Formatting differences.
- **Table A6 Reproduced.** Verified against `attrition_el.tex`. The table is fully reproducible. However, the code-generated version includes additional variables that are not reported in the paper.
- **Table A7 Reproduced.** Verified against `itt_main_el.tex`.
- **Table A8 Reproduced.** Verified against `itt_hmoutcomes_el.tex`.

- **Figure A4** *Reproduced*. Verified against `iate_hist.png`.
- **Figure A5** *Reproduced*. Verified against `HTEs_ML.png`.
- **Figure A7** *Reproduced*. Verified against `postings.png`.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: Intel(R) Xeon(R) Gold 6226R CPU @ 2.90GHz
- Memory available: 16.0 GB
- Software version: Stata 19.5 MP, R 4.5.1