



From Training to Earning: The 7-Year Impact of Dual Apprenticeships on Youth Employment

Second Submission: PP_CIV_2025_498

Madalynn Smith, Ankriti Singh

reproducibility@worldbank.org

January 8, 2026

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*From Training to Earning: The 7-Year Impact of Dual Apprenticeships on Youth Employment*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit in the main section of the paper and appendix were reproduced accurately**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Updating the working directory.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 2.5 hours to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors by email.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on two types of data: accessible (public but not included in the reproducibility package), and forthcoming data.
 - Reviewers used forthcoming/accessible/restricted data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. The data is forthcoming on the World Bank Microdata Library.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming/accessible/limited-access/restricted data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is not yet publicly available but is expected to be made available through the World Bank Microdata Library in the future.

- **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
- **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
- **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure 1** Reproduced.
- **Table 1** Reproduced.
- **Table 2** Reproduced.
- **Table 3** Reproduced.
- **Table 4** Reproduced.

Results in the Annex

- **Figure A1** Reproduced.
- **Figure A2** Reproduced.
- **Figure A3** Reproduced.
- **Table A1** Reproduced.
- **Table A2** Reproduced.
- **Table A3** Reproduced.
- **Table A4** Reproduced.
- **Table A5** Reproduced.
- **Table A6** Reproduced.
- **Table A7** Reproduced.
- **Table A8** Reproduced.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: INTEL(R) XEON(R) PLATINUM 8562Y+ 2.80 GHz (2 processors)
- Memory available: 32.0 GB
- Software version: Stata 18.0 MP