



Comparing the Effectiveness of Low Carbon Policies: A Technology Diffusion Approach

Second Submission: RR_ASI_2025_536

Ceren Huryol, Luis Eduardo San Martin

reproducibility@worldbank.org

February 2, 2026

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Comparing the Effectiveness of Low Carbon Policies: A Technology Diffusion Approach*”, except for Figure 10 (not included in the reproducibility package).

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- Every exhibit in the main section, except for Figure 10 (not included in the reproducibility package due to copyright restrictions on the code), and the annex of the paper has been reproduced accurately.
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Changing the file path in the do-file *main.do*
 2. Copying the results of *IndonesiaCaseStudy.prg* to *IndonesiaCaseStudy.xlsx*.
 3. Copying the results of *ThailandCaseStudy.prg* to *ThailandCaseStudy.xlsx*.
 4. Copying the results of *VietnamCaseStudy.prg* to *VietnamCaseStudy.xlsx*.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 10 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors by email on January 12, 2026.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on three types of data: open, limited-access (available after purchase) and restricted data (available only to the authors).
 - Open data is included in the public reproducibility package.

- Reviewers used limited-access and restricted data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package.
- *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the restricted data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is restricted and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, please refer to the README file.
 - **Code:** Code files for figure 10 are copyright-restricted and not included in the reproducibility package due. All other code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included.
 - **Outputs:** Some outputs are generated by code that is not included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Dependencies environment:**
 - * **Stata:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.
 - * **EViews:** The reproducibility package does not use external dependencies.
 - * **Excel:** The reproducibility package does not use external dependencies.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure 1** Does not apply. The exhibit does not contain own analysis results.
- **Figure 2** Reproduced.
- **Figure 3** Does not apply. The exhibit does not contain own analysis results.
- **Figure 4** Reproduced.
- **Figure 5** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6a** Results reproduced, but the figure includes manual changes from code output.
- **Figure 6b** Reproduced.
- **Figure 7** Does not apply. The exhibit does not contain own analysis results.
- **Table 1** Does not apply. The exhibit does not show analysis results.
- **Table 2** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8** Reproduced.
- **Table 3** Does not apply. The exhibit does not show analysis results.
- **Figure 9** Reproduced.

- **Table 4** Does not apply. The exhibit does not show analysis results.
- **Table 5** Does not apply. The exhibit does not show analysis results.
- **Figure 10** Does not apply. The exhibit generation is not part of the reproducibility package.

Results in the Annex

- **Figure 11** Reproduced.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise, version 25H2
- Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) Ultra 7 165U (2.10 GHz)
- Memory available: 31.5 GB
- Software version:
 - EViews 14
 - Stata 18.5 MP
 - Microsoft Excel for Microsoft 365 MSO