



Completing the AfCFTA Mosaic: Liberalization of Services

Sixth Submission: RR_WLD_2026_415

Mahin Tariq, Nihaa Sajid

reproducibility@worldbank.org

March 13, 2026

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Completing the AfCFTA Mosaic: Liberalization of Services*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit of the paper has been reproduced accurately.**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Changing the file paths is the main dofile.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 5 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors by email in the reproducibility package.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on 1 type of data: open.
 - Open data is included in the public reproducibility package.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** All data sources are publicly available and included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

*List of exhibits and reproducibility status***Results in the Main Section of the Paper**

- **Figure 1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 2** Reproduced.
- **Figure 3** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4** Reproduced.
- **Figure 5** Does not show analysis results. Sourced from WTO and World Bank. (2023)
- **Table 1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6** Reproduced.
- **Table 2** Does not show analysis.
- **Figure 7** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.
- **Figure 8** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx."
- **Figure 9** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx."
- **Figure 10** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx."

- **Figure 11** Reproduced.
- **Table 3** This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx."
- **Table 4** Does not show analysis.
- **Table 5** Does not show analysis.
- **Table 6** Does not show analysis.
- **Table 7** Does not show analysis.
- **Figure 12** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx."
- **Figure 13** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx."

Results in the Annex

- **Table A1** Does not show analysis.
- **Table A2** Does not show analysis.
- **Table A3** Does not show analysis.
- **Table B1** Does not show analysis. The exhibit is cited from Borchert and Go (2023).
- **Table B2** Does not show analysis. The exhibit is cited from Borchert and Go (2023).
- **Table B3** Does not show analysis. The exhibit is cited from Borchert and Go (2023).
- **Table B4** Does not show analysis. The exhibit is cited from Borchert and Go (2023).
- **Figure B1** Reproduced.
- **Table C1** All values match This was compared against the table in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.

- **Figure C1** Reproduced.
- **Table C2** All values match This was compared against the table in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.
- **Figure C2** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.
- **Figure C3** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.
- **Figure D1** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.
- **Figure D2** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.
- **Figure D3** All values match This was compared against the figure in the excel sheet FINAL_AfCFTA_Mosaic_graphs_20260225.xlsx, sourced from Envisageresults.xlsx.
- **Table E1** Does not show analysis.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
- Memory available: 15.7 GB
- Software version: Stata 19.5 MP