



Labor Market Returns to Socio-Emotional Traits and the Impacts of Training Programs: A Meta-Analysis

First Submission: RR_WLD_2026_560

Ankriti Singh

reproducibility@worldbank.org

March 4, 2026

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Labor Market Returns to Socio-Emotional Traits and the Impacts of Training Programs: A Meta-Analysis*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit of the paper has been reproduced accurately.**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Updating the working directory.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 5 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on one types of data: limited-access (forthcoming to World Bank staff).
 - Reviewers used forthcoming data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. The data is forthcoming on the World Bank Development Data Hub.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**

- **Data:** Some data is limited-access and has not been included in the reproducibility package. It will be made available to World Bank staff through the World Bank Development Data Hub in the future.
- **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
- **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
- **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Table 1** Does not apply.
- **Table 2** Reproduced.
- **Table 3** Reproduced.
- **Figure 1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 2** Reproduced.
- **Figure 3** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4** Reproduced.
- **Figure 5** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6** Reproduced.

Results in the Annex

- **Table A1** Does not apply.
- **Table A2** Does not apply.
- **Table A3** Reproduced.
- **Figure A1** Does not apply.
- **Figure A2** Does not apply.
- **Figure A3** Does not apply.
- **Figure A4** Does not apply.
- **Figure A5** Does not apply.
- **Figure A6** Does not apply.
- **Figure A7** Reproduced.
- **Figure A8** Reproduced.
- **Figure A9** Reproduced.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: INTEL(R) XEON(R) PLATINUM 8562Y+ 2.80 GHz (4 processors)
- Memory available: 32.0 GB
- Software version: Stata 18.0 MP; Python 3.9