



Turning Promise Into Practice: Building A Coherent ECEC Workforce System In Viet Nam

Third Submission: RR_VNM_2026_576

Vaishnavi Dhas

reproducibility@worldbank.org

July 3, 2026

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper *“Turning Promise Into Practice: Building A Coherent ECEC Workforce System In Viet Nam”*.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit in the main section of the paper and 10 randomly selected exhibits in the appendix were reproduced accurately**
- The exhibits in this paper are generated using Excel and QGIS.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors by email on June 12, 2026.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on two types of data: open and forthcoming data.
 - Open data is included in the public reproducibility package.
 - Reviewers used forthcoming data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. The data is forthcoming on the World Bank Microdata Library and Development Data Hub.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming and restricted data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is restricted and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, refer to the README file.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

*List of exhibits and reproducibility status***Results in the Main Section of the Paper**

- **Figure 1 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure on sheet Fig 1 in the file MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. The README file and Excel sheet describe how the figure was generated.
- **Figure 2 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure on sheet Fig 2 in the file MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. The README file and Excel sheet describe how the figure was generated.
- **Figure 3 Reproduced.** Figure produced in QGIS. The README file and MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx outline the sources and steps used to generate the figure.
- **Figure 4 Reproduced.** Figure produced in QGIS. The README file and MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx outline the sources and steps used to generate the figure.
- **Figure 5 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure on sheet Fig 5 in the file MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. The README file and Excel sheet describe how the figure was generated.
- **Figure 6 Reproduced.** Figure produced in QGIS. The README file and MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx outline the sources and steps used to generate the figure.
- **Figure 7 Reproduced with manual changes.** Compared against the figure in Figure 7.xlsx in the Outputs folder. The categories differ slightly, but do not affect the reproducibility.
- **Figure 8 Reproduced with manual changes.** Compared with Figure 8.xlsx. Formatting slightly differs, which does not affect reproducibility.
- **Figure 9 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure on sheet Fig 9 in the file MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. The README file and Excel sheet describe how the figure was generated.
- **Figure 10 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure on sheet Fig 10 in the file MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. The README file and Excel sheet describe how the figure was generated.
- **Figure 11 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure on sheet Fig 11 in the file LEY and TLEC figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. The README file and Excel sheet describe how the figure was generated. Formatting differs slightly but does not affect reproducibility.
- **Figure 12 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure in sheet Fig 12 in the file LEY and TLEC figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. Formatting slightly differs, but this does not affect reproducibility.
- **Figure 13 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure in sheet Fig 13 in the file LEY and TLEC figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. Formatting slightly differs, but this does not affect reproducibility.

- **Figure 14 Reproduced.** Compared with the figure in sheet Fig 14 in the file LEY and TLEC figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder. The README and LEY and TLEC figures.xlsx describe how the figure was created.
- **Table 1 Reproduced.** Compared with the table on sheet Table 1 in the file MOET Administrative data_tables and figures.xlsx, located in the Outputs folder.

Results in the Annex

For the Appendix, we did not review every exhibit. Instead, we randomly selected 10 exhibits from the remaining datasets to assess the appendix. Our review was based on those 10 exhibits. Since they were chosen randomly, we are operating under the assumption that if all randomly selected exhibits are reproducible, then the rest should be as well. The seed used to generate the random selection was 211189, the Stata version used was 19.5 MP, and the exhibits selected were: 6, 7, 9, 17, 19, 21, 24, 25, 27, 28, i.e. B5a, B5b, B7, B15, B17, B19, B22, B23, B25, B26.

- **Table B5a Reproduced.** Compared with table in sheet B5a in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file outlines the data source and the table construction process.
- **Table B5b Reproduced.** Compared with file B5b.xlsx in the Source data folder. The README outlines the source of the data.
- **Table B7 Reproduced** Compared with B7 in file Appendix.xlsx Table compiled manually by the authors using data from multiple sources outlined in the README file.
- **Table B15 Reproduced.** Compared with table B15 in sheet B14-15 in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file and Appendix.xlsx document the data and construction process for this table.
- **Table B17 Reproduced.** Compared with table in sheet B17 in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file and Appendix.xlsx document the data and construction process for this table.
- **Table B19 Reproduced.** Compared with table in sheet B19 in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file and Appendix.xlsx document the data and construction process for this table.
- **Table B22 Reproduced.** Compared with table in sheet B22 in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file and Appendix.xlsx document the data and construction process for this table.
- **Table B23 Reproduced.** Compared with table in sheet B23 in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file and Appendix.xlsx document the data and construction process for this table.
- **Table B25 Reproduced.** Compared with table in sheet B23 in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file and Appendix.xlsx document the data and construction process for this table.
- **Table B26 Reproduced.** Compared with table in sheet B23 in file Appendix.xlsx. The README file and Appendix.xlsx document the data and construction process for this table.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: INTEL(R) XEON(R) PLATINUM 8562Y+ 2.80 GHz (2 processors)
- Memory available: 32.0 GB
- Software version: Stata 19.5 MP