



Population Thresholds And Classification Stability: Evidence From The World Bank's Small States Classification Rule

First Submission: RR_WLD_2026_681

Camila Ayala

reproducibility@worldbank.org

July 18, 2026

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper "*Population Thresholds And Classification Stability: Evidence From The World Bank's Small States Classification Rule*".

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit in the main section of the paper and in the appendix were reproduced accurately**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Updating the working directory in line 1 of the do-file "o.master.do", and running it.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 20 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors in the reproducibility package.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on one type of data: open.
 - Open data is included in the public reproducibility package.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming/accessible/limited-access/restricted data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** All data sources are publicly available and included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

*List of exhibits and reproducibility status***Results in the Main Section of the Paper**

- **Table 1** **Reproduced**. Verified against `table_xs_baseline.csv`.
- **Table 2** **Reproduced**. Verified against the results generated in Stata and saved in `log.smcl`.
- **Table 3** Does not show analysis results.
- **Table 4** **Reproduced**. Verified against the results generated in Stata and saved in `log.smcl`. Table was verified following the instructions in the README.
- **Figure 1** **Reproduced**. Verified against `fig_lpoly_outcomes_lnpop.png`.

Results in the Annex

- **Figure A1** **Reproduced**. Verified against `figA1_partial_residuals.png`.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: Intel(R) Xeon(R) Gold 6226R CPU @ 2.90GHz
- Memory available: 32.0 GB
- Software version: Stata 19.5 MP