



Raising Revenue Right A Roadmap for Domestic Resource Mobilization

Third Submission: FR_WLD_2026_735

Ankriti Singh, Nihaa Sajid, Mahin Tariq

reproducibility@worldbank.org

August 28, 2026

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper "*Raising Revenue Right A Roadmap for Domestic Resource Mobilization*".

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit of the paper has been reproduced accurately.**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Updating the working directory in line 10 of "main.do".
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 10 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the report shared by the authors on August 27th, 2026.
- **Verification Process and Data Handling:**
 - The reproducibility package relies on 4 types of data: open, accessible, forthcoming, and restricted data (available only from the data owners).
 - Open data is included in the public reproducibility package.
 - Reviewers used accessible/restricted data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package.
 - Some of the author compiled data is forthcoming to World Bank Development Data Hub.
 - *data_hash_report.csv* lists the SHA256 hashes of all files in the Data folder to support data integrity checks. Users who acquire the forthcoming/accessible/limited-access/restricted data can use this file to verify that the data has not been altered.

- **Reproducibility Summary:**

- **Data:** Some data is restricted and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, please refer to the README file.
- **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
- **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
- **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

Overview

- **Figure O.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure O.2** Reproduced.
- **Figure O.3** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure O.4** Reproduced.
- **Figure O.5** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table O.1** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Chapter 1

- **Figure 1.1** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 1.2** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 1.3** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 1.4** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 1.5** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 1.6** Reproduced.
- **Figure 1.7** Reproduced.

Chapter 2

- **Figure B.2.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 2.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 2.2** Reproduced.
- **Figure 2.3** Reproduced.

- Figure 2.4 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.5 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.6 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.7 Reproduced.
- Figure B.2.2.1 Reproduced.
- Figure B.2.3.1 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.8 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.9 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.10 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.11 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.12 Reproduced.
- Figure 2.13 Reproduced.
- Table 2.1 Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- Figure 2A.1 Reproduced.

Chapter 3

- Figure B.3.1.1 Reproduced.
- Figure 3.1 Reproduced.
- Figure 3.2 Reproduced.
- Figure 3.3 Reproduced.
- Figure 3.4 Reproduced.
- Figure 3.5 Reproduced.
- Figure B.3.3.1 Reproduced.
- Figure 3.6 Reproduced.
- Table 3.1 Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Chapter 4

- Figure 4.1 Reproduced.
- Figure 4.2 Reproduced.
- Figure 4.3 Reproduced.

- **Table 4.1** Reproduced. The exhibit was manually prepared in Excel.
- **Figure 4.4** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4.5** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4.6** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4.7** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 4.8a** Reproduced. This exhibit was approved by the World Bank Cartography unit and may differ slightly from the code output.
- **Figure 4.8b** Reproduced.
- **Figure B.4.5.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4.9** Reproduced.
- **Figure 4.10** Reproduced.
- **Table 4.2** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Chapter 5

- **Figure 5.1** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure B.5.1.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure B.5.1.2** Reproduced.
- **Figure B.5.3.1** Reproduced.
- **Table 5.1** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Chapter 6

- **Figure 6.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6.2** Reproduced.
- **Table 6.1** Does not apply.
- **Table 6.2** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output of this report.
- **Figure 6.3** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6.4** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6.5** Reproduced.
- **Figure 6.6** Reproduced.
- **Table 6.3** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Chapter 7

- **Figure B.7.6.1** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Chapter 8

- **Figure 8.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8.2** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.3** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8.4** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.5** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.6** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.7** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.8** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.9** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8.10** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8.11** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.12** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.13**
- **Figure 8.14** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8.15** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table 8.1** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table 8.2** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.16** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.17** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.18** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8.19** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.20 Panel A** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 8.20 Panel B** Reproduced.
- **Figure 8.21** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table 8.3** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Chapter 9

- **Table 9.1** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table 9.2** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Figure 9.1** Reproduced.
- **Figure 9.2** Reproduced.
- **Table 9.3** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table 9.4** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table 9.5** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.
- **Table 9.6** Does not apply. The exhibit is not an analytical output.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: INTEL(R) XEON(R) PLATINUM 8562Y+ 2.80 GHz (2 processors)
- Memory available: 128.0 GB
- Software version: Stata 19.5 MP