Reproducible Research Repository

Direct and Indirect Effects of Subsidized Dual Apprenticeships

Third Submission: RR_CIV_2024_107
María Reyes Retana, Mahin Tariq
reproducibility@worldbank.org
July 31st, 2024

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper *"Direct and Indirect Effects of Subsidized Dual Apprenticeships"*.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings

2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status

3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:

  1. Changing the file paths in the main do file

- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.

- The code takes approximately 5 hours to run.

- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors on July 26th.

- Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately.

- **Reproducibility Summary**:

  - **Data**: All data sources are publicly available but not included in the reproducibility package.
  - **Code**: All code files, from cleaning to analysis, are included in the package.
  - **Outputs**: All outputs are generated by code and included in the reproducibility package.
  - **Reproducibility verification**: Reviewers had access to the same materials in the public reproducibility package. The reviewers verified that publicly available data matches the data used in the reproducibility package
  - **Dependencies environment**: The reviewers created a new environment for dependencies using the latest versions available for each dependency at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure 1** Does not show analysis results

- **Table 1** Reproduced

- **Table 2** Reproduced

- **Table 3** Reproduced

- **Table 4** Reproduced

- **Table 5** Reproduced

- **Table 6** Reproduced

- **Table 7** Reproduced

- **Table 8** Reproduced

- **Table 9** Reproduced

- **Table 10** Reproduced

- **Figure 2A** Reproduced

- **Figure 2B** Reproduced

- **Figure 2C** Reproduced

- **Figure 2D** Reproduced

- **Figure 3A** Reproduced

- **Figure 3B** Reproduced

- **Figure 4A** Reproduced

- **Figure 4B** Reproduced

- **Figure 4C** Reproduced

- **Figure 5A** Reproduced

- **Figure 5B** Reproduced

- **Figure 5C** Reproduced

- **Figure 5D** Reproduced

- **Figure 6A** Reproduced

- **Figure 6B** Reproduced

- **Figure 7** Does not show analysis results

- **Figure 8** Does not show analysis results

Results in the Appendix

- **Figure A1** Reproduced

- **Figure A2** Reproduced

- **Figure A3** Reproduced

- **Figure A4** Reproduced The line in the figures shown in the paper is red, while the line in the figure produced by the code is dashed and black. However, the rest of the figure is identical, and this is considered reproducible.

- **Figure A5** Reproduced

- **Table A1** Reproduced

- **Table A2** Reproduced

- **Table A3** Reproduced

- **Table A4** Reproduced

- **Table A5** Reproduced

- **Table A6** Reproduced

- **Table A7** Reproduced

- **Table A8** Reproduced

- **Table A9** Reproduced with minor differences Values for "covariates" are missing from the code output.

- **Table A10** Reproduced

- **Table A11** Reproduced

- **Table A12** Reproduced

- **Table A13** Reproduced

- **Table A14** Reproduced

- **Table A15** Reproduced

- **Table A16** Reproduced

- **Table A17** Reproduced

- **Table A18** Reproduced

- **Table A19** Reproduced

- **Table A20** Reproduced

Reproduction Environment

- Paper exhibits were reproduced in a computer with the following specifications:

  - OS: Windows 10 Enterprise

  - Processor: Intel(R) Xeon(R) Gold 6226R CPU @ 2.90GHz, 16 Core(s)

  - Memory available: 32 GB

  - Software version: Stata version 18