



Private Management of African Protected Areas Improves Wildlife and Tourism Outcomes but with Security Concerns in Conflict Regions

Second Submission: RR_AFRD_2024_117

Mahin Tariq, Luis Eduardo San Martin

reproducibility@worldbank.org

June 14th, 2024

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Private Management of African Protected Areas Improves Wildlife and Tourism Outcomes but with Security Concerns in Conflict Regions*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Reproducing the R environment with renv
- The code takes approximately 50 hours to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors on OneDrive on April 12, 2024.
- All exhibits reproduced as shown in the paper.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Two datasets are restricted and have not been included in the reproducibility package. All other datasets used are included. For more details, please refer to the README file.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Reproducibility verification:** Reviewers used data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and some of this is not included in the package. The reviewers did not verify if publicly available data matches the data provided by the authors.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure 1a** Reproduced
- **Figure 1b** Reproduced
- **Figure 2a** Reproduced
- **Figure 2b** Reproduced
- **Figure 2c** Reproduced
- **Figure 2d** Reproduced
- **Figure 2e** Reproduced
- **Figure 2f** Reproduced
- **Figure 2g** Reproduced
- **Figure 2h** Reproduced
- **Figure 2i** Reproduced
- **Figure 2j** Reproduced
- **Figure 2k** Reproduced
- **Figure 2l** Reproduced
- **Figure 2l** Reproduced
- **Table 1** Reproduced

Results in the Annex

- **Figure S1** Reproduced
- **Figure S2** Reproduced
- **Figure S3a** Reproduced
- **Figure S3b** Reproduced
- **Figure S4a** Reproduced.
- **Figure S4b** Reproduced
- **Figure S5** Reproduced
- **Figure S6** Reproduced
- **Figure S7** Reproduced

- **Figure S8** Reproduced
- **Figure S9** Reproduced
- **Figure S10** Reproduced
- **Figure S11a** Reproduced
- **Figure S11b** Reproduced
- **Figure S12a** Reproduced
- **Figure S12b** Reproduced
- **Figure S13a** Reproduced
- **Figure S13b** Reproduced
- **Figure S13c** Reproduced
- **Figure S14** Reproduced
- **Figure S15** Reproduced
- **Figure S16** Reproduced
- **Figure S17a** Reproduced
- **Figure S17b** Reproduced
- **Figure S17c** Reproduced
- **Figure S18** Reproduced
- **Table S1** Reproduced
- **Table S2** Reproduced
- **Table S3** Reproduced
- **Table S4** Reproduced
- **Table S5** Does not show analysis results
- **Table S6** Reproduced
- **Table S7** Reproduced

Reproduction Environment

- Paper exhibits were reproduced in a computer with the following specifications:
 - OS: Windows 10 Enterprise, version 22H2
 - Processor: Intel(R) Xeon(R) Gold 6132 CPU @ 2.60GHz 2.60 GHz (2 processors)
 - Memory available: 128 GB
 - Software version: R 4.2.1 "Bird Hippie"