



Greening Global Trade: Policy Priorities for Developing Countries

First Submission: FR_WLD_2024_177

María Reyes Retana, Mahin Tariq

reproducibility@worldbank.org

2024-08-07

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper "*Trade and the Climate Emergency: Policy Priorities for Developing Countries*".

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper the authors sent by email on July 30.
- The outputs are generated in Excel, and the instructions for reproducing these outputs are outlined in the README file. We verified the figures in the Excel files, but we did not verify the underlying data.
- Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately. See full details in the List of exhibits and reproducibility status.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is confidential and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, please refer to the README file.
 - **Code:** The package does not include code. The outputs are generated in Excel, and the instructions for reproducing these outputs are outlined in the README file.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are created manually in Excel, but instructions for producing these outputs are included in the README file.
 - **Reproducibility verification:** Reviewers used data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and not all are included in the public reproducibility package. The reviewers did not verify if publicly available data matches the data provided by the authors.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure E1** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The figure in the Excel file contains more information than the one in the paper, which is not a problem for reproducibility. In particular, GDP is present in the Excel file, as well as RC-FYAX, <2C, <2C-EARLY. We only verified the contents of the sheet, and not the underlying calculations, as we did not have access to the code. Excel: TC2_CGE_results.xlsx Sheet: exp_LMY (chart)
- **Figure 1** Does not have analysis results.
- **Figure 2** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. We only verified the contents of the sheet, and not the underlying calculations, as we did not have access to the code. Excel: TC2_CGE_results.xlsx Sheet: xp_hic (chart).
- **Figure 3** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. We only verified the contents of the sheet, and not the underlying calculations, as we did not have access to the code. Excel: TC2_CGE_results.xlsx Sheet: exp_LMY (chart)
- **Figure 4** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The figure in the Excel file contains more information than the one in the paper, which is not a problem for reproducibility. In particular, IND PHL RUS SSA TUR XEA XEC XLC XMN XSA are present in the Excel, but not included in the Figure on the paper. We only verified the contents of the sheet, and not the underlying calculations, as we did not have access to the code. Excel: TC2_CGE_results.xlsx Sheet: GVC_electronics (chart).
- **Figure 5** Does not have analysis results.
- **Figure 6** Does not have analysis results. This figure is sourced from another paper that hasn't been published and was shared directly with the authors. Espitia et al. (forthcoming).
- **Figure 7a** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The graph can be found in the Excel file: TC2_CBAM exposure index.xlsx Sheet: figure 7a
- **Figure 7b** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The graphs can be found in the Excel file: TC2_CBAM exposure index.xlsx Sheet: figure 7b
- **Figure 8** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The format and colors of the graph in the Excel file TC2_Renewable are different, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.
- **Figure 9** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The format and colors of the graph in the Excel file TC2_EV are different, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.
- **Figure 10** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The format and colors of the graph in the Excel file TC2_CM are different, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.

- **Figure 11** Does not have analysis results. This figure is sourced from another paper available here.
- **Figure 12** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel.
- **Figure 13** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The format and colors of the graph in the Excel file TC2_GVC Exposure Indicator_textile are different, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.
- **Figure 14** Does not have analysis results. This figure is available here. The map is a screenshot of Relative CBAM Exposure Index, deselecting countries with carbon pricing.
- **Figure 15** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The format and colors of the graph in the Excel file TC2_Emission Scenario.xlsx are different, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.
- **Figure 16** Reproduced but requires manual steps. This figure was produced using Excel. The format and colors of the graph in the Excel file TC2_GTAP Sectors Exports and Emissions.xlsx are different, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.

Results in the Annex

- **Annex 1** Does not have analysis results.
- **Annex 2** Does not have analysis results.

Reproduction Environment

- Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:
 - OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
 - Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
 - Memory available: 15.7 GB
 - Software: Microsoft Excel for Microsoft 365 MSO