



Can Public Credit Schemes Improve Access to Finance for Small Businesses? Evidence from Indonesia

Third Submission: RR_IDN_2024_151_v03

Mahin Tariq

reproducibility@worldbank.org

August 23rd, 2024

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Can Public Credit Schemes Improve Access to Finance for Small Businesses? Evidence from Indonesia*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Changing the file paths and running the code.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 30 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors.
- Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately. Figures 11 and 12, however, could not be verified due to data confidentiality.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is confidential and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, please refer to the README file.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Reproducibility verification:** Reviewers used data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and not all are included in the public reproducibility package. The reviewers did not verify if publicly available data matches the data provided by the authors.
 - **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment for dependencies using the latest versions available for each dependency at the moment of the review.

*List of exhibits and reproducibility status***Results in the Main Section of the Paper**

- **Figure 1** **Reproduced** The figure is sourced from World Development Indicators. There are rounding off discrepancies since the data in the paper was last updated on 06/28/2024. This does not jeopardize reproducibility.
- **Figure 2** **Reproduced** This figure is sourced from Bank of Indonesia. Values for "Percent of Accounts are for MSMEs" were manually calculated in excel to create the graph. Reviewers checked data from 2021 and 2022 to verify the data points in the exhibit.
- **Figure 3** **Reproduced** This figure is sourced from Indonesia's Financial Services Authority (OJK). Values for "Percent of Loans for MSME" were manually calculated in excel to create the graph. Reviewers checked data from 2022 and 2023 to verify the data points in the exhibit.
- **Table 1** Does not show analysis results
- **Table 2** Does not show analysis results
- **Figure 4** **Reproduced**
- **Figure 5** **Reproduced**
- **Table 3** **Reproduced**
- **Figure 6** **Reproduced**
- **Figure 7** **Reproduced**
- **Figure 8** **Reproduced**
- **Figure 9** **Reproduced**
- **Figure 10** **Reproduced**
- **Figure 11** **Could not be verified** The output for this figure could not be verified due to the confidentiality of the SIKP database. This is clarified in the README file.
- **Figure 12** **Could not be verified** The output for this figure could not be verified due to the confidentiality of the SIKP database. This is clarified in the README file.

Results in the Annex

- **Figure A1** **Reproduced**
- **Figure A2** **Reproduced**
- **Figure A3** **Reproduced**
- **Figure A4** **Reproduced**
- **Figure A5** **Reproduced**

Reproduction Environment

- Paper exhibits were reproduced in a computer with the following specifications:
 - OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
 - Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
 - Memory available: 15.7 GB
 - Software version: Stata version 18