Human Rights for Combatting Corruption - And Vice Versa

First Submission: FR_WLD_2024_204
Nihaa Sajid
reproducibility@worldbank.org
October 9th, 2024

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper *"Human Rights for Combatting Corruption - And Vice Versa"*.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings

2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status

3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:

  1. Changing the file paths in the main do file

  2. Setting the ado folder.

  3. Running the line: sysdir set PLUS "path"

- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.

- The code takes approximately 2 minutes

- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors on September 28th.

- Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately.

- **Reproducibility Summary**:

  – **Data**: All data sources are publicly available but not included in the reproducibility package.

  – **Code**: All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.

  – **Outputs**: All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.

  – **Reproducibility verification**: Reviewers had access to the same materials in the public reproducibility package. The reviewers did not verify if publicly available data matches the data in the reproducibility package.

  – **Dependencies environment**: The reviewers created a new environment for dependencies using the latest versions available for each dependency at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Summary Figure A** Does not show analysis results

- **Summary Figure B** All values reproduced No figure was found in the sheet. Values were verified against the table in the excel sheet *Replication Tables and Figures.xlsx* sheet "Table 2"

- **Summary Figure C** Reproduced The Y-axes of both figures are different, but the values reproduced

- **Figure 1** Does not show analysis results

- **Figure 2** Reproduced No figure was found in the excel sheet *Replication Tables and Figures.xlsx*. Values were manually verified

- **Figure 3** Reproduced No figure was found in the excel sheet *Replication Tables and Figures.xlsx*. Values were manually verified

- **Figure 4** Does not show analysis results

- **Figure 5** Reproduced The Y-axis of both figures are different, but the values reproduced

- **Figure 6** Reproduced The Y-axis of both figures are different, but the values reproduced

- **Figure 7** Reproduced The Y-axis of both figures are different, but the values reproduced

- **Figure 8** Reproduced The Y-axis of both figures are different, but the values reproduced

- **Table 1** Does not show analysis results

- **Table 2** Reproduced

- **Table 3** Does not show analysis results

Reproduction Environment

- Paper exhibits were reproduced in a computer with the following specifications:

  - OS: Windows 11 Enterprise

  - Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz

  - Memory available: 15.7 GB

  - Software version: Stata 18.0 MP

  - Software version: Microsoft Excel for Microsoft 365 MSO