



Data for Better Governance: Building Government Analytics Ecosystems in Latin America and the Caribbean

First Submission: FR_LAC_2024_222

Maria Reyes Retana, Ankriti Singh

reproducibility@worldbank.org

2024-11-15

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper " *Data for Better Governance: Building Government Analytics Ecosystems in Latin America and the Caribbean* " .

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Change the path in the main do file. (only for the graphs do file)
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 10 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors.
- Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately. See details in the List of exhibits and reproducibility status
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is not yet publicly available but is expected to be made available through the Microdata Library in the future.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Reproducibility verification:** Reviewers used data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. The reviewers did not verify if publicly available data matches the data provided by the authors.
 - **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment for dependencies using the latest versions available for each dependency at the moment of the review.

*List of exhibits and reproducibility status***Results in the Main Section of the Paper**

- **Figure 1.1** *Reproduced, but the figure was manually generated using Excel.* Colors differs due to changes in formatting, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.
- **Figure 1.2** *Reproduced, but the figure was manually generated using Excel.* Colors differs due to changes in formatting, but this does not jeopardize reproducibility.
- **Figure 4.1** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.2** *Reproduced, but includes manual steps.* We reviewed the results generated by the Stata console and compared them against the paper. The code correctly produces a table with country codes, which is then used to generate the figure. Upon review, all the numerical values matched the paper for this specific figure when comparing country codes.
However, it is important to clarify that the set of countries is not consistent across Figures 4.2, 4.11, and 4.13. For example, "Country 1" in Figure 4.2 may represent a different country than "Country 1" in Figure 4.11 or Figure 4.13.
- **Figure 4.3** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.4** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.5** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.6** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.7** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.8** *Reproduced, but final figure includes manual changes.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper. In addition, there are two figures produced by the code, which are merged into one for the final paper.
- **Figure 4.9** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.10** *Reproduced.* The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.11** *Reproduced, but includes manual steps.* We reviewed the results generated by the Stata console and compared them against the paper. The code correctly produces a table with country codes, which is then used to generate the figure. Upon review, all the numerical values matched the paper for this specific figure when comparing country codes.

However, it is important to clarify that the set of countries is not consistent across Figures 4.2, 4.11, and 4.13. For example, "Country 1" in Figure 4.2 may represent a different country than "Country 1" in Figure 4.11 or Figure 4.13.

- **Figure 4.12 Reproduced.** The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.
- **Figure 4.13 Reproduced, but includes manual steps.** We reviewed the results generated by the Stata console and compared them against the paper. The code correctly produces a table with country codes, which is then used to generate the figure. Upon review, all the numerical values matched the paper for this specific figure when comparing country codes.

However, it is important to clarify that the set of countries is not consistent across Figures 4.2, 4.11, and 4.13. For example, "Country 1" in Figure 4.2 may represent a different country than "Country 1" in Figure 4.11 or Figure 4.13.

- **Figure 4.14 Reproduced.** The figure was generated by the code, but its formatting differed from the one presented in the paper.

Reproduction Environment

- Paper exhibits were reproduced in a computer with the following specifications:
 - OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
 - Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
 - Memory available: 15.7 GB
 - Software version: Stata version 18 MP