



Impacts and Spillovers of a Low-Cost Multi-faceted Economic Inclusion Program in Chad

Second Submission: RR_TCD_2024_196

Mahin Tariq

reproducibility@worldbank.org

February 27, 2025

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Impacts and Spillovers of a Low-Cost Multi-faceted Economic Inclusion Program in Chad*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately.**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Changing the file path in the main dofile
 2. Enabling access to VBA in Excel
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 2 hours to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper in the updated reproducibility package shared by the authors on February 24th.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** All data is temporarily embargoed by the authors (expected to be made public in the future).
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Reproducibility verification:** Reviewers used data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. The reviewers did not verify if publicly available data matches the data provided by the authors.
 - **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment for dependencies using the latest versions available for each dependency at the moment of the review.

*List of exhibits and reproducibility status***Results in the Main Section of the Paper**

- **Figure 1** Does not show analysis results
- **Figure 2** Does not show analysis results
- **Table 1** Reproduced
- **Table 2** Reproduced
- **Table 3** Reproduced
- **Table 4** Reproduced
- **Table 5** Reproduced
- **Table 6** Reproduced
- **Table 7** Reproduced
- **Table 8** Reproduced
- **Table 9** Reproduced
- **Table 10** Reproduced
- **Table 12** Reproduced

Results in the Annex

For the Appendix, we did not review every exhibit. Instead, we randomly selected 10 exhibits from the remaining exhibits to assess the appendix. Our review was based on those 10 exhibits. Since they were chosen randomly, we are operating under the assumption that if all randomly selected exhibits are reproducible, then the rest should be as well. The seed used to generate the random selection was [358302], and the exhibits selected were: 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 11, 13, 18, 19, 21. Supplementary tables were not verified.

- **Table A2** Reproduced
- **Table A3** Reproduced
- **Table A5** Reproduced
- **Table A6** Reproduced
- **Table A7** Reproduced
- **Table A11** Reproduced
- **Table A13** Reproduced
- **Table A18** Reproduced
- **Table A19** Reproduced
- **Table A21** Reproduced

Reproduction Environment

- Paper exhibits were reproduced in a computer with the following specifications:
 - OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
 - Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
 - Memory available: 15.7 GB
 - Software version: Stata 18.0 MP