Reproducible Research Repository

Industrial Policy under Constraints: Evidence from Pakistan's Export Subsidy Schemes

Second Submission: RR_PAK_2025_370
Maria Reyes Retana, Kanika Shokeen
reproducibility@worldbank.org
2025-06-25

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper *"Industrial Policy under Constraints: Evidence from Pakistan's Export Subsidy Schemes"*. This report is the second review.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings

2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status

3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately.**

- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:

  1. Changing the path in the main do file.

  2. Running the code.

- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.

- The code takes approximately 10 minutes to run.

- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors by email on June 20th.

- **Reproducibility Summary**:

  - **Data**: Some data is restricted and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, please refer to the README file.

  - **Code**: All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.

  - **Outputs**: All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.

  - **Reproducibility verification**: Reviewers used data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package. The reviewers also attempted to verify whether the publicly available version of the data matched the one used in the original analysis, but found that the public version had since been updated and differs from the version used by the authors. Hashes for the datasets are included in the reproducibility package for verification purposes.

– **Dependencies environment**: The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Table 1** Does not show analysis results

- **Figure 1** Reproduced.

- **Figure 2a** Reproduced.

- **Figure 2b** Reproduced.

- **Figure 2c** Reproduced.

- **Figure 2d** Reproduced.

- **Figure 2e** Reproduced.

- **Figure 3a** Reproduced.

- **Figure 3b** Reproduced.

- **Figure 4a** Reproduced.

- **Figure 4b** Reproduced.

- **Figure 4c** Reproduced.

- **Figure 4d** Reproduced.

- **Figure 4e** Reproduced.

- **Table 2** Reproduced. This exhibit was produced using strictly confidential data that external replicators cannot access. The data was provided to the reproducibility team under a non-disclosure agreement.

- **Figure 5** Reproduced. This exhibit was produced using strictly confidential data that external replicators cannot access. The data was provided to the reproducibility team under a non-disclosure agreement.

- **Figure 6a** Reproduced.

- **Figure 6b** Reproduced.

Results in the Annex

- **Table A.1** Reproduced.

- **Table A.2** Reproduced.

- **Table A.3** Reproduced.

- **Table A.4** Reproduced.

- **Figure A1a** Reproduced.

- **Figure A1b** Reproduced.

- **Figure A1c** Reproduced.

- **Figure A1d** Reproduced.

- **Figure A1e** Reproduced.

- **Figure A2** Reproduced. Code does not produce a figure titled *esgarment_h2.png* as outlined in the README, but is to be compared to *synt_61_NC_2c.png* and *synt_62_NC_2c.png*.

- **Figure A3** Reproduced. Code does not produce a figure titled *esmadeups_h2.png* as outlined in the README, but is to be compared to *synt_57_NC_2c.png* and *synt_63_NC_2c.png*.

- **Figure A4** Reproduced. Code does not produce a figure titled *esprocessed_h2.png* as outlined in the README, but is to be compared to *synt_53_NC_2c.png*, *synt_54_NC_2c.png*, *synt_55_NC_2c.png*, *synt_59_NC_2c.png*, and *synt_60_NC_2c.png*.

- **Figure A5** Reproduced. Code does not produce a figure titled *esfabricyarn_h2.png* as outlined in the README, but is to be compared to *synt_50_NC_2c.png*, *synt_52_NC_2c.png*, and *synt_56_NC_2c.png*.

- **Figure A6** Reproduced. Code does not produce a figure titled *esfabricyarn_h2.png* as outlined in the README, but is to be compared to *synt_51_NC_2c.png* and *synt_58_NC_2c.png*.

- **Figure A7a** Reproduced.

- **Figure A7b** Reproduced.

- **Figure A7c** Reproduced.

- **Figure A7d** Reproduced.

- **Figure A8a** Reproduced.

- **Figure A8b** Reproduced.

- **Figure A8c** Reproduced.

- **Figure A8d** Reproduced.

- **Figure A9a** Reproduced.

- **Figure A9b** Reproduced.

- **Figure A9c** Reproduced.

- **Figure A9d** Reproduced.

- **Figure A10a** Reproduced.

- **Figure A10b** Reproduced.

- **Figure A10c** Reproduced.

- **Figure A10d** Reproduced.

- **Figure A11a** Reproduced.

- **Figure A11b** Reproduced.

- **Figure A12a** Reproduced.

- **Figure A12b** Reproduced.

- **Figure A12c** Reproduced.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise

- Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz

- Memory available: 15.7 GB

- Software version: Stata 18.0 MP