



Decarbonization in MENA Countries: An Empirical Analysis of Policy Impacts

First Submission: RR_MNA_2025_372

Ankriti Singh

reproducibility@worldbank.org

July 10, 2025

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Decarbonization in MENA Countries: An Empirical Analysis of Policy Impacts*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately.**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Updating the working directory.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 2 minutes to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors in the package.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** Some data is restricted, but all data necessary to reproduce the analysis has been included in the reproducibility package in accordance with applicable data use terms. For more information, please refer to the README file.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** Some outputs are not generated by code (created manually in Excel) but instructions for producing these outputs are included in the README file.
 - **Reproducibility verification:** Reviewers worked with the same materials included in the public reproducibility package. They cross-checked the publicly available datasets and identified discrepancies, which may reflect periodic updates or changes in the original sources. As a result, re-running the analysis using the current versions of these datasets (as of July 2025) may yield different outputs. The dataset requiring access permissions was not independently verified by reviewers; however, it is included in the package, and file hashes have been provided to ensure data integrity.

- **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers created a new environment using the latest versions of dependencies available at the moment of the review.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure 1** Does not apply.
- **Figure 2** Does not apply.
- **Figure 3** Does not apply.
- **Figure 4** Does not apply.
- **Figure 5** Does not apply.
- **Figure 6** Does not apply.
- **Figure 7** **Reproduced.** The figures were created manually in Excel.
- **Figure 8** **Reproduced.** The figures were created manually in Excel.
- **Figure 9** **Reproduced.** The figures were created manually in Excel.
- **Figure 10** **Reproduced.** The figures were created manually in Excel.
- **Figure 11** **Reproduced.** The figures were created manually in Excel.
- **Table 1** **Reproduced.**
- **Table 2** **Reproduced.**
- **Table 2a** **Reproduced.**
- **Table 3** **Reproduced.**
- **Table 4** **Reproduced.** The constant values differ slightly between columns 1 and 3 (by less than 0.02), which is due to differences in Stata versions used.

Results in the Annex

- **Figure A.2.1** **Reproduced.**
- **Table A.2.1** Does not apply.
- **Table A.2.2** **Reproduced.**

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
- Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
- Memory available: 15.7 GB
- Software version: Stata 18.0 MP