Reproducible Research Repository

# *What I Really Want: Policy Maker Views on Education in East Asia Pacific*

*Second Submission*
*Saron Hailu*
*Patricia Paskov*
*Maria Reyes Retana*
*PRWP Reproducibility Verification*
*reproducibility@worldbank.org*
*November 6, 2023*

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper *"What I Really Want: Policy Maker Views on Education in East Asia Pacific"*.

**Contents in this review**:



## *Main findings*

- The code was successfully executed on three new computers.
- The package takes 3 minutes to run.
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code is found to be reproducible using the provided package.
- Noticed manual adjustments in most figures and tables, such as varied y-axis labels, legend labels, and axis ranges. These discrepancies don't make the package non-reproducible.

## *Reproducibility assessment*

- Paper exhibits were attempted to be reproduced in computers with the following specifications:
  - Computer 1:
    - OS: macOS Ventura
    - Processor: Apple M1
    - Memory available: 8 GB
    - Software version: Stata MP 14.0
  - Computer 2:
    - OS: MacOS Ventura 13.4
    - Processor: Dual-Core Intel Core i3, 1.1 GHz

    - Memory Available: 8 GB 3733 MHz LPDDR4X
    - Software Version: Stata 16.1
  - Computer 3:
    - OS: Windows 11 Enterprise
    - Processor: Intel(R) Core(TM) i5-1145G7 CPU @ 2.60GHz
    - Memory available: 15.7 GB
    - Software version: Stata MP 17.0

- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors in their reproducibility package *What Policymakers Want Oct 27 2023.pdf*. Our validation involved comparing the results generated by the code with the exhibits in the paper to assess their consistency.

## *List of exhibits and reproducibility status*

**Results in the Main Section of the Paper**

- **Table 1** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: label change, rounding of numbers.
- **Figure 1** Reproduced
- **Figure 2** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: code produces y-axis label but the paper does not.
- **Figure 3** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: code produces y-axis label but the paper does not, legend labels do not match.
- **Figure 4** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: legend labels do not match.
- **Figure 5** Reproduced with manual computations. The figure uses probit model coefficients, which are then used to manually calculate this figure in the `Figures_and_tables.xlsx` file. Instructions for these calculations can be found in the README.
- **Figure 6** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: minor changes to the legend.
- **Figure 7** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: minor changes to the legend.
- **Figure 8** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: minor changes to the legend.
- **Figure 9** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: colors differ.
- **Figure 10** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from the code output: changes to the legend.

- **Figure 11** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from the code output: changes to the legend.
- **Figure 12** Results reproduced in Stata 16+, but includes manual changes from the code output: y-axis label does not reproduce.
- **Figure 13** Results reproduced in Stata 16+, but includes manual changes from the code output: y-axis label does not reproduce.
- **Figure 14** Reproduced with manual computations. The figure uses probit model coefficients, which are then used to manually calculate this figure in the `Figures_and_tables.xlsx` file. Instructions for these calculations can be found in the README.
- **Figure 15** Reproduced
- **Figure 16** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: minor changes to the legend.
- **Figure 17** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: changes to the legend.
- **Figure 18** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: y-axis ticks 0-100 in paper and 0-1 in code, legend labels, and colors differ.
- **Figure 19** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: x-ticks in code are 0-1.8 and 0-180 in paper.
- **Figure 20** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: manual aggregation of two graphs.
- **Figure 21** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: minor changes to the legend.
- **Figure 22** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: y-axis in code is -.8-1.2 and -80-120 in paper, legend labels unformatted in code.

**Results in the Appendix**

- **Table 1** Does not show analysis results, as the authors didn't produce figures.
- **Table 2** Results reproduced, but table is missing Girl-boy gap. There are some differences in the values, but they can be attributed to rounding variations.
- **Table 3** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: aggregation of tables and changing of labels.
- **Table 4** Results reproduced, but includes manual changes from code output: aggregation of tables and changing labels.
- **Figure 23** Does not apply. The figure is not produced by the authors